June 1984

Mystic Cognition in Zen Buddhism and in Christianity: a study of D. T. Suzuki and St. John of the Cross,

a thesis submitted for the degree of Ph.D. to the University of Lancaster, UK

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this thesis is to analyse and to compare mystic or higher cognition in two figures who can be seen as representative of their traditions. In doing so the study hopes to attain an insight into the relationship between the lived experience of Zen Buddhism and Christianity.

Apart from the Introduction and the General Conclusion, the body of the study falls into three parts. The first (Chapters I-III) deals with how higher cognition is attained, revealing that despite significant divergences the accounts of both authors move, as it were, in a parallel direction. The second part (Chapters IV-V) considers the mode by which higher knowledge is appropriated. Here, while emphasizing the differences between the two accounts, it is seen that this appropriation is based on the same fundamental elements for each. Finally, in the last part (Chapters VI-VII), the study looks at what is known by higher cognition. This is seen to contain an area where there is profound overlap, though one which also emphasizes the distinctness of each system.

Throughout the discussion it becomes apparent that each account contains the building blocks out of which the other could be constructed. The way in which this is so, however, is not the same for both. Suzuki's Zen Buddhism, thus, could be said to indicate John's Christian position, but finally to deny it, while John's view of higher cognition points to a form of higher knowing that includes Suzuki's but which concentrates upon aspects of knowing denied by Suzuki. These contrasting attitudes can be described as 'exclusive' (for Suzuki) and 'inclusive' (for John) and are seen, ultimately, to be the outcome of contrasting views upon the relation between the knowing subject and the object known.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Works by St. John of the Cross

The Collected Works of St. John of the Cross (ICS: Washington D.C.: 1973) trans. and ed. Kieran Kavanaugh and Otilio Rodriguez.

The Complete Works of St. John of the Cross (Anthony Clarke: Wheathampstead, Herts: 1974) trans and ed. E. Allison Peers.

Obras de San Juan de la Cruz (Burgos: Tipografia de <<El Monte Carmelo>>: 1943) edicion y notas del P. Silverio de Santa Teresa.

Works by D.T. Suzuki (in alphabetical order)

D.T. Suzuki. An Introduction to Zen Buddhism (Rider: London: 1974; 1st pub. 1949).

- D.T. Suzuki. Collected Writings on Shin Buddhism (Shinshu Otanika: Kyoto: 1973).
- D.T. Suzuki. Essays in Zen Buddhism, First Series (Rider: London: 1980; 1st pub.1950).
- D.T. Suzuki. Essays in Zen Buddhism, Second Series (Rider: London: 1980; 1st pub. 1953).
- D.T. Suzuki. Essays in Zen Buddhism, Third Series (Rider: London: 1970; 1st pub.1953).
- D.T. Suzuki. Living by Zen (Rider: London: 1972 (revised edition); 1st pub. 1950).
- D.T. Suzuki. Manual of Zen Buddhism (Rider: London: 1974; 1st pub. 1950).
- D.T. Suzuki. Mysticism Christian and Buddhist (Mandala Books, Unwin Paperbacks: 1979; 1st pub. 1957).
- D.T. Suzuki. Outlines of Mahayana Buddhism (Shoken Books: New York: 1963; 1st pub. 1907).
- D.T. Suzuki. Sengai: the Zen Master (New York Graphic Society: Greenwich, Connecticut:1971).

Shin Buddhism (George Allen and Unwin: London: 1980).

- D.T. Suzuki. Studies in the Lankavatara Sutra (Routledge and Kegan Paul: London and Boston: 1975; 1st pub. 1930).
- D.T. Suzuki. Studies in Zen (Rider: London: 1955).
- D.T. Suzuki. The Essence of Buddhism (Hozokan: Kyoto:1968;1st pub. 1948)
- D.T. Suzuki. The Essentials of Zen Buddhism (An Anthology of Suzuki's writings) (Rider:London: 1962) ed. Bernard Philips.
- D.T. Suzuki. The Field of Zen (The Buddhist Society: London:1980)
- D.T.Suzuki. The Lankavatara Sutra (Suzuki's translation into English) (Routledge and Kegan Paul: london: 1966; 1st pub. 1932)
- D.T. Suzuki. The Training of the Zen Bud & ist Monk (University Books: New York:1964, 1st pub. 1934).
- D.T. Suzuki. The Zen Doctrine of No Mind (Rider: London: 1969; 1st pub. 1949).
- D.T. Suzuki. What is Zen? (The Buddhist Society: London: 1971).
- D.T. Suzuki. Zen and Japanese Buddhism (Japanese Travel Bureau: 1967).

Zen and Japanese Culture (Routledge and Kegan Paul: New York: 1973; 1st pub. 1959).

D.T. Suzuki. Zen Buddhism and Psychoanalysis (a collection of essays by Suzuki, Erich Fromm and Richard De Martino) (Souvenir Press: London: 1974).

Other Works (Listed Under Author's Name)

Abishiktananda (Henri Le Saux). Prayer (SPCK: London: 1967).

Thomas Aquinas. Compendium of Theology (B. Herder: Bingham and New York: 1947) trans. Cyril Vollert.

Thomas Aquinas. Summa Theologiae (The Blackfriars Edition: London) Vol. III trans. Herbert McCabe; Vol. XII trans. P. T. Durbin; Vol. XIV trans. T. C. O'Brien; Vol. XLVI trans. Jordan Aumann.

Augustine of Hippo. Confessions. (Penguln ~lasslcs: Hanmondsworth, Middlesex: 1975) trans. R. S. Pine-Coffin.

John Baillie. The Sense of the Presence of God (Oxford University Press: London: 1962).

W. M. Theodore de Barry. The Buddhist Tradition in India, China, Japan (Vintage Books: London: 1972).

Timothy Bearsworth. A Sense of Presence (The Religious Experience Research Unit: Oxford: 1977).

A Benedictine of Standbrook Abbey . Mediaeval Mystical Tradition and St. John of the Cross (Burns and Oates: London: 1954).

John D. Bettis (editor) . The Phenomenology of Religion (SCM: London: 1969).

John Bowker. Problems of Suffering in Religions of the World (Cambridge University Press: 1970).

John Bowker. The Religious Imagination and the Sense of God (Clarendon Press: Oxford: 1978).

John Bowker. The Sense of God (Clarendon Press: Oxford: 1973).

Borden P. Bowne. Theory of Thought and Knowledge (Klaus Reprint: New York: 1970).

Louis Bouyer (art.) 'Mysticism: An Essay in the History of the Word' in Understanding Mysticism ed. Richard Woods.

Guy Bugault. La Notion de «Prajna» ou de Supience selon les Perspectives du «Mahayana» (Editions E. De Boccard: Paris: 1968).

Paul M. Van Buren (art.) 'Anselm's Formula and the Logic of 'God' ' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 9 1973 (Cambridge University Press: London)

Cuthbert Butler Western Mysticism (Arrow Books: London: 1960)

Garma C. C. Chang The Buddhist Teaching of Totality (The Pennsylvania State University Press: University Park and London: 1971).

John Chapman Spiritual Letters (New Ark Library, Sheed and Ward: London:1935).

Piero Coda and Jesus Castellano Cervada (art.) 'La Comprensione di Gesu Cristo vella Teologia e nella Spiritualita del Medioevo e dell'Epoca Moderna' in Gesu Cristo (Citt'a Nuova Editrice: Rome: 1981)

Edward Conze. Buddhism: Its Essence and Development (Bruno Cassirer: Oxford: 1974).

Edward Conze. Buddhist Thought in India (Alm Arbor Paperbacks, University of Michigan Press: 1967).

Edward Conze. Further Buddhist Studies (Bruno Cassirer: Oxford: 1975).

Edward Conze. ThirtyYears of Buddhist Studies (Bruno Cassirer: Oxford: 1967).

Francis H. Cook Hua-yen Buddhism (The Pennsylvania State University Press: University Park and London: 1977).

John Dalrymple. Costing Not Less Than Everything (Darton, Lapman and Todd: London: 1975).

Brian Davies (art.) 'What happens when you pray?' New Blackfriars (journal) December 1980.

J-M Dechanet. Christian Yoga (Search Press: London: 1973) trans. Roland Hindmarsh.

Daya Krishna (art.) 'Religious Experience Language and Truth' in Religious Experience and Truth ed. Sidney Hook.

Arthur J. Deikman (art.) 'Bimodal Consciousness and the Mystic Experience' in Understanding Mysticism ed. Richard Woods.

Arthur J. Deikman (art.) 'Deautomization the Mystic Experience' in Understanding Mysticism ed. Richard Woods.

George Dicker Perceptual Knowledge (D. Reidel: Dordrecht, Holland; Boston, U.S.A.; London, England: 1980).

Dionysius the Areopagite on the Divine Names and the Mystical Theology (SPCK, Macmillan: London: 1920) trans. C. E. Rolt.

Heinrich Dumoulin. A History of Zen Buddhism (Faber and Faber: London:1963).

Heinrich Dumoulin. Zen Enlightenment: Origins and Meaning (Weatherhill: New York and Tokyo: 1979).

Louis Dupre (art.) 'The Mystical Experience of the Self and Its Philosophical Significance' in Understanding Mysticism ed Richard Woods.

Mircea Eliade The Sacred and the Profane (Harper and Row: New York:1961).

Mircea Eliade The Two and the One (Harvill Press: London: 1965).

Sir Charles Eliot Japanese Buddhism (Routledge and Kegan Paul: London:1964).

Robert S. Ellwood Mysticism and Religion (Prentice-Hall: New Jersey:1980).

Maurice Fieldman (art.) 'Martin Buber and Oriental Religions' in Buddhist and Western Philosophy ed. Nathan Katz.

John Findlay (art.) 'The Logic of Mysticism' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 2, 1966-1967 (Cambridge University Press: London).

Flew and MacIntyre (eds.) New Essays in Philosophical Theology (SCM:London: 1955).

Bede Frost Saint John of the Cross (Hodder and Stoughton: London:1937).

Reginald Garrigon-Lagrange Christian Perfection and Completion (B. Herder: St. Louis and London: 1939).

Etienne Gilson (art.) 'Unitas Spiritus' in Understanding Mysticism ed. Richard Woods.

Robert M. Gimello (art.) 'Mysticism and Meditation' in Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis ed. Steven Katz.

Aelred Graham Conversations Christian and Buddhist (Collins: London:1969).

Aelred Graham Zen Catholicism (Collins: London: 1964).

H. Van Glasenapp (art.) 'Buddhism and Christianity' in The Wheel (journal) no. 19, 1963 (Buddhist Publishing Society: Kandy, Ceylon).

H. Van Glasenapp Buddhism: A Non-Theistic Religion (George Allen and Unwin: London: 1970).

Julie Gowen (art.) 'Religion, Reason and Ninian Smart' in ReligiousStudies (journal) Vol. 9, 1973 (Cambridge University Press: London).

Melidi Yazdi Ha'iri (Ph.D. Thesis) A Treatise in Knowledge by Presence (University of Toronto: 1979).

Eugen Herrigel Zen in the Art of Archery (Routledge and Kegan Paul: London: 1976) trans. R. F. C. Hull.

Gustie L. Herrigel Zen in the Art of Flower Arrangement (Routledge and Kegan Paul: London: 1958) trans. R. F. C. Hull

Jack Hick (art.) 'Mystical Experience as Cognition' in Understanding Mysticism ed. Richard Woods.

A. A. Hodges God Beyond Knowledge (Macmillan: London and Basingstoke:1979).

Sidney Hook (ed.) Religious Experience and Truth (Oliver and Boyd: London: 1962).

James R. Horne (art.) 'Which Mystic has the Revelation?' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 11,1975 (Cambridge University Press: London).

James R. Horne (art.) 'Do Mystics Perceive Themselves' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 13, 1977 (Cambridge University Press: London).

Baron Friedrich von Hugel The Mystical Element of Religion: (Volume First) (James Clarke: London: 1961).

Christmas Humphreys Buddhism (Pelican: Harmondsworth, Middlesex: 1972).

Christmas Humphreys. Zen: a Way of Life (Teach Yourself Books: London: 1962).

M. Conrad Hyers Zen and the Comic Spirit (Rider: London: 1974).

Leon Andrew Immerman (art.) 'Mhst We Know What We Say?' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 15, Sept. 1979 (Cambridge University Press: London).

W. R. Inge Mysticism in Religion (Hutchinson University Library: London: 1947).

Toshihiko Izutsu Towards a Philosophy of Zen Buddhism (Imperial Iranian Academy of Philosophy: Tehran: 1977).

William James The Varieties of Religious Experience (The Modern Library: New York: 1929).

Rune Johansson The Psychology of Nirvana (George Allen and Unwin: London: 1969).

William Johnston Christian Zen (Gill and Macmillan: Dublin: 1977).

William Johnston. Silent Music (Fontana, Collins: Glasgow: 1974).

William Johnston. The Inner Eye of Love (Collins: London: 1978).

William Johnston The Mysticism of the Cloud of Unknowing (Anthony Clarke: Wheathampstead, Herts: 1978).

William Johnston. The Still Point: Reflections on Zen and Christian Mysticism (Fordham University Press: New York: 1970).

Elvin W. Jones (art.) 'Buddhist Theories of Existents' in Mahayana Buddhist Meditation: Theory and Practice ed. Minoruta Kiyota.

J. K. Kadowski Zen and the Bible (Routledge and Kegan Paul: London: 1980).

Nathan Katz (ed.) Buddhist and Western Philosophy (Sterling Publishers: New Delhi: 1981).

Steven Katz (art.) 'Language Epistemology and Mysticism' in Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis ed. Steven Katz.

Steven Katz. Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis (Sheldon Press: London:1978).

E. W. Kemp Canonization and Authority in the Western Church (Oxford University Press: London: 1948).

Jiyu Kennett Zen is Eternal Life (originally published as 'Selling Water by the River') (Dharma Publishing: California: 1976).

Winston L. King Buddhism and Christianity (George Allen and Unwin: London: 1963).

Hideo Kishimoto (art.) 'Some Japanese Cultural Traits and Religions' in The Japanese Mind. ed. Charles Moore.

Joseph M. Kitagawa (art.) 'Experience, Knowledge and Understanding' in Religious Studies (journal) vol. 11, 1975 (Cambridge University Press: London).

Minoruta Kiyota (ed.) Mahayana Buddhist Meditation: Theory and Practice (University Press of Hawaii: Honolulu: 1978).

David Knowles What is Mysticism? (Burns and Oates: London: 1967).

Seraphina Lansdown (art.) 'The Language of Silence' in The Downside Review (journal) Vol. 98, No. 330, January 1980.

Louis Lavelle The Meaning of Holiness (Burns and Oates: London: 1954) trans. Dorothea O'Sullivan.

Trevor Legett Zen and the Ways (Routledge and Kegan Paul: London: 1978).

Trevor Ling (art.) 'Buddhist Mysticism' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 1, 1965-1966 (Cambridge University Press: London).

Vladimir Lossky The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church (James Clarke: London: 1973).

Chiara Lubich Parola di Vita (Citta Nuova Editrice: Rome: 1975).

Scritti Spirituali I: L'Attrattiva del Tempo Moderno (Citta Nuova Editrice: Rome: 1978).

Scritta Spirituali II: L'Essenziale di Oggi (Citta Nuova Editrice: Rome: 1978).

C. B. Martin (art.) 'A Religious Way of Knowing' in New Essays in Philosophical Theology ed. Flew and MacIntyre.

Joseph Marechal (art.) 'Ontology and Theology of Christian Mysticism' in Understanding Mysticism ed. Richard Woods.

Studies in the Psychology of the Nystics (Magi Books: New York: 1964).

Jacques Maritain The Degrees of Knowledge (Geoffrey Bles: London: 1959) trans. (under the supervision of) Gerald B. Phelan.

Jacques Maritain (art.) 'The Natural Mystical Experience and the Void' in Understanding Mysticism ed. Richard Woods.

John Louis Meis (Th.D. Thesis) The Experience of Nothingness in the Mystical Theology of St. John of the Cross (Graduate Theological Union: 1979).

Thomas Merton. Contemplative Prayer (Darton Longman and Todd: London: 1969).

Thomas Merton. On Zen (Sheldon Prees: London: 1976).

Thomas Merton. The Ascent to Truth (Clonmore and Reynolds:

Dublin: 1951).

Paul Molinari. Julian of Norwich: The Teaching of a Fourteenth Century English Mystic (Longmans, Green and Co.: London, New York, Toronto: 1958).

William Pepperell Montague. The Ways of Knowing (George Allen and Unwin, London; Macmillan, New York: 1962).

Charles A. Moore (ed.). The Japanese Mind (East-West Press: Hawaii: 1967).

Peter Moore (art.) 'Mystical Experience, Mystical Doctrine, Mystical Technique' in Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis ed. Steven Katz.

Gaspare Mura (art.) 'La Notte, Simbolo del Nulla Sacro, in Heidegger e in Giovanni della Croce' in Nuova Umanita (journal) 21, May-June 1982 (Citta Nuova Editrice: Rome).

T. R. V. Murti. The Central Philosophy of Buddhism (Mandala Books, Unwin Paperbacks: London: 1980).

Geddes MacGregor Philosophical Issues in Religious Thought (Houghton Mifflin: Boston: 1973).

Francis James MacGuire (Ph.D. Thesis) Practical Mysticism: the Psychosocial Dynamics of Change in the Mystical Tradition, Christian and Buddhist (Berkeley, California: 1976).

Alasdair MacIntyre (art.) 'Visions' in New Essays in Philosophical Theology ed. Flew and MacIntyre.

John MacMurray The Structure of Religious Experience (Faber and Faber: London: 1936).

Charlene McDermott (art.) 'Yogic Direct Awareness' in Mahayana Buddhist Meditation: Theory and Practice ed. Minoruta Kiyota.

George Nakhnikian (art.) 'On the Cognitive Import of Certain Conscious States' in Religious Experience and Truth ed. Sidney Hook.

Seyyed Hossein Nasr (art.) 'Self-Awareness and Ultimate Selfhood' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 13, 1977 (Cambridge University Press: London).

Jacob Needleman A Sense of the Cosmos (Doubleday: Garden City, New York: 1975).

Yasinji Nirimura Fundamentals of Buddhism (Shoshu International Centre: Tokyo; 1978).

Nikkyo Niwano .Honzai: The Object of Worship of Rissho Kosei-Kai (Kosei Publishing: Tokyo: 1969).

Nikkyo Niwano. Lifetime Beginner (Kosei Publishing: Tokyo: 1968).

Nikkyo Niwano. The Richer Life (Kosei Publishing: Tokyo: 1975).

Robert A. Oates (art.) 'Classical Theism and Pantheism: A Victory for Process Theism?' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 13, 1977 (Cambridge University Press: London).

Michael Oakshott. Experience and Its Modes (Cambridge University Press: London: 1933).

Rudolph Otto. Mysticism: East and West (Macmillan: New York: 1970).

The Idea of the Holy (Oxford University Press: London, Oxford, New York: 1980).

H. P. Owen. The Christian Knowledge of God (The Athlone Press: London: 1969).

Raimundo Panikkar. The Trinity in the Religious Experience of Man (Orbis Books, New York; Darton Longman and Todd, London: 1973).

E. Allison Peers. Spirit of Flame (SCM: London: 1943).

D. Z. Philips (art.) 'Religious Beliefs and Language Games' in The Philosophy of Religion (Oxford University Press: Oxford: 1971) ed. Basil Mitchell.

H. H. Price. Perception (Methuen: London: 1932).

Walpola Rahula. What the Buddha Taught (Gordon Fraser: Bedford: 1972).

J. C. Ryle Holiness. (James Clarke: London: 1956).

Joseph Runzo (art.) 'Visions, Pictures, and Rules' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 13, 1977 (Cambridge University Press: London).

William Sargent. The Mind Possessed (Cox and Wigman: London: 1963).

John Sahadat (art.) 'Advaita Philosophy and Non-contradiction' in The Heythrop Journal April 1982, Vol. XXXIII, No. 2 (Heythrop College).

Ben-Ami Scharfstein Mystical Experience (Basil Blackwell: Oxford: 1973).

Paul F. Schmit (art.) 'Frustrating Strategies in Religious Discussion' in Religious Experience and Truth ed Sidney Hook.

Francis A. Schaeffer Escape from Reason (Inter-Varsity Press: London: 1972).

Katsuki Sekida Zen Training: Methods and Philosophy (Weatherhill: New York and Tokyo: 1975).

Patrick J. Sherry (art.) 'Philosophy and the Saints' in The HeythropJournal (Heythrop College, 1977).

Patrick J. Sherry Religion, Truth and Language Games (Macmillan: London and Basingstoke: 1977).

Patrick J. Sherry (art.) 'Saints and Sanctity' in Catholic Gazette (journal) Nov. 1979.

F. N. Sibley (ed.) Perception: a Philosophical Symposium (Methuen: London: 1974).

F. N. Sibley (art.) 'Analysing Seeing' in Perception: a Philosophical Symposium ed. F. N. Sibley.

Ninian Smart Beyond Ideology (Collins: London: 1981).

Ninian Smart Philosophers and Religious Truth (SCM: London: 1969).

Ninian Smart Reasons and Faiths (Routledge and Kegan Paul: London: 1958).

Ninian Smart The Concept of Worship (Macmillan: London and Basingstoke: 1972).

Ninian Smart The Phenomena of Religion (Macmillan: London and Basingstoke:1973).

Ninian Smart (art.) 'Understanding Religious Experience' in Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis ed. Steven Katz.

Huston Smith (art.) 'Transcendence in Traditional China' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 2 1966-1967 (Cambridge University Press: London).

Margaret Smith (art.) 'The Nature and Meaning of Mysticism' in Understanding Mysticism ed. Richard Woods.

Frits Staal Exploring Mysticism (Penguin: Harmondsworth, Middlesex: 1975).

W. T. Stace Mysticism and Philosophy (Macmillan: London: 1961).

Fredrick J. Streng (art.) 'Language and Mystical Awareness' in Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis ed. Steven Katz.

Beatrice Lane Suzuki Mahayana Buddhism (George Allen and Unwin: London: 1959) (Introduction by D. T. Suzuki).

Medagampala Sumanashanta (Ph.D. Thesis) A Comparison of Buddhist and Christian Perfection (Northwestern University: Illinois: 1973).

Richard Swinburne The Existence of God (Oxford University Press: Oxford: 1979).

The Cloud of Unknowing (John M. Watkins: London: 1934) ed. and Introduction by Evelyn Underhill.

The Platform Sutra of the Sixth Patriarch (Columbia University Press: New York and London: 1967) trans., ed. and introduction by Philip B. Yampolsky.

Herbert Thurston The Physical Phenomena of Mysticism (Burns and Oates: London: 1952).

Paul Tillich Christianity and the Encounter of the World Religions (Columbia University Press: New York and London: 1964).

Evelyn Underhill Mysticism (Methuen: London: 1957).

Evelyn Underhill. Mystics of the Church (James Clarke: London: 1925).

Evelyn Underhill. Worship (Nisbet: London: 1937).

William J. Wainwright (art.) 'Mysticism and Sense Perception' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 9, 1973 (Cambridge University Press: London).

William J. Wainwright Mysticism (The Harvester Press: Brighton: 1981).

James Walsh ed. Spirituality Through the Centuries (Burns and Oates: London: 1964).

M. O'C. Walsh (art.) 'Buddhism and Christianity: A Positive Approach' in The Wheel No. 275/276 (Buddhist Publication Society: Kandy, Sri Lanka: 1980).

G. J. Warmock ed. The Philosophy of Religion (Oxford University Press: Oxford: 1971).

R. J. Zwi Werblowsky (art.) 'On the Mystical Rejection of Mystical Illuminations: a Note on St. John of the Cross' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 1, 1966 (Cambridge University Press: London).

Elizabeth Christina Wilhemsen (Ph. D. Thesis) Process of Knowing and Process of Communication in St. John of the Cross (Graduate School of St. Louis: 1980).

Rowan Williams The Wound of Knowledge (Darton, Longman and Todd: London: 1979).

Richard Woods ed. Understanding Mysticism (The Athlone Press: London: 1980).

Karl Wojtyla. Faith According to Saint John of the Cross (Ignatius Press: San Francisco: 1981).

Keith E. Yandell (art.) 'Religious Experience and Rational Appraisal' in Religious Studies (journal) Vol. 10, 1974 (Cambridge University Press: London).

R. C. Zaehner Mysticism: Sacred and Profane (Oxford University Press: London, Oxford, New York: 1969).

Giuseppe M. Zanghi (art.) 'Per Introdurci nello Studio del Mistero di Dio' in II Dio de Gesu Cristo (Citta Nuova Editrice: Rome: 1982).